

**California Bay-Delta Public Advisory Committee
Environmental Justice Subcommittee
Meeting Summary
January 24, 2003
Jones & Stokes Associates
2600 V Street
Sacramento, CA
9:00 a.m. – 12:15 p.m.**

I. Welcome / Introductions

- Ken McGhee, EJ Coordinator, welcomed the group and introduced himself.
- After introductions, the agenda and encouraged public comment. Ken requested that subcommittee members review the minutes of last meeting and submit any proposed changes to him.
- launching into a review of the Environmental Justice Subcommittee (EJSC) Work Plan, Ken expressed deep gratitude to the members of the subcommittee and the Environmental Justice Coalition for Water (EJCW), for their hard work in establishing the subcommittee. He reported that in his first 60 days of work as the EJ Coordinator, he met with various managers of CALFED and was encouraged by them to involve EJSC representatives in committee projects. The CALFED managers voiced strong support for the work of the EJSC.
- Initial discussions with CALFED management regarding the purpose, activities, and work plan of the EJSC revealed a need to identify tangible activities or projects for the subcommittee to adopt. The Director of CALFED had recommended that the first issue the EJSC might examine is that of fish contamination. It was also suggested that the EJSC serve as a clearinghouse of information regarding environmental justice issues related to CALFED projects.
- Ken highlighted groups and meetings that might benefit from EJSC collaboration:
 - California Biodiversity Council
 - Southern California Dialogue
 - Literacy for Environmental Justice (Bayview/Hunter's Point area of SF Bay)
 - Asthma Coalition of Contra Costa County
 - All CALFED Subcommittees
- It was suggested that future EJSC meetings occur in the communities where EJ issues occur. He felt this should perhaps be the last meeting held during business hours in an urban "office-type" setting. Various members of the subcommittee agreed.

- Concern was expressed that people in EJ communities might not have all the necessary tools to understand or become engaged in meetings. Martha Guzman, EJSC Co-Chair, responded that the EJSC needs to incorporate communities into the CALFED process, serve as a resource for people of color, poverty, etc., and bridge the disconnection.
- Michelle Henry-Ellis, Literacy for Environmental Justice, suggested that the EJSC should listen to the needs of the EJ communities and address those issues in a meeting rather than transfer to the neighborhoods a very structured, CALFED-type meeting or presentation which might not be appreciated.
- One member recommended a field trip to the Delta to learn the mechanics of the Bay-Delta ecosystem.
- Another member repeated the need to incorporate communities into CALFED. It was asked if EJ representatives are getting involved in tribal and other types of governmental processes.
- The importance of CALFED defining and educating people about EJ was stressed, as was the need to get resources out into the communities and neighborhoods. It was suggested that trainings occur through community groups for CALFED, and visa versa; it is a “two-way street” of education.
- Ken suggested that the group identify and create working groups.

II. EJSC Work Plan

Current Status

- The Bay Delta Public Advisory Committee (BDPAC) adopted the Work Plan. Among other things, this guidance document suggests ways to incorporate EJ, integrate with all CALFED Program Elements, perform outreach, and collect input from affected communities.
- Eugenia Laychak, CALFED, congratulated the EJSC on this accomplishment, and recommended that the EJSC prioritize tasks to implement.
- Ken told the group he has been strongly encouraged by CALFED’s Program Managers to involve EJSC representatives in other subcommittees.
- Torri Estrada, EJ Coalition for Water, expressed concern that this sentiment was merely lip service, and that a mechanism to ensure EJ involvement is required. Ken responded that the Project Managers truly want EJSC members to be “at the table” and he agreed that a process to ensure EJSC involvement should be established.
- A subcommittee member requested copies of performance measures and (Proposal Solicitation Plans (PSP) for the various CALFED committees.
- Martha Guzman requested budgeting stipends so that EJSC members could attend other meetings and be paid for their time.
- It was asked how one would learn where and when which committees would meet; Ken responded he could put names on CALFED committee mailing lists. Visiting CALFED’s website was also suggested.

- The concern that local communities need tools to be educated so they can be involved or prepared for meetings was repeated. EJ issues often become marginalized, which can lead to cumulative adverse impacts.
- The question of how one would perform an EJ assessment was raised. Ken responded that the EPA has a training that could serve as a model. (See “4 Domains” handout)

What Remains

- Regarding the Work Plan, nearly all of the strategies under objective 1 have been accomplished. Torri Estrada theorized that objectives 4, 5, and 6 require funding. He wondered how the programs would be funded in 4-5 years.
- Martha Guzman asked what the goals are of the other committees. These should be included in the CALFED proposal solicitation process (PSPs). She stressed the importance of getting managers to set goals, principles, and commitments in line with EJ objectives. She recommended making a plan or timeline for the commitments of managers.
- Dan Wermiel, CALFED Watershed Program, responded that many programs are currently developing performance measures. He suggested asking managers if their PSPs involve criteria regarding EJ. How many projects have been funded in their programs that have EJ components?
- A subcommittee member who works with the EWA (Environmental Water Account) asked how one would write an EJ or community outreach component of a work program. She said EWA is looking for effective tools that meet the needs of EJ communities. Can the EJSC develop a plan to assist others with tools to implement EJ policies?
- Torri Estrada responded that although EJ issues have been around for a long time, agencies have not been organized or concerned with them. Agencies must become engaged with communities and provide tools so communities can get involved with them. What are the top issues that are of concern to EJSC? EJSC does not have to look far for projects. Perhaps there should be an MOU (memorandum of understanding) to have EJ representatives at meetings? EJSC needs to move forward and have tangible goals that are attainable and serve as a model for others.

III. EJSC ACTIVITIES 2003

- Ken introduced Sandra Salzar-Thompson, Office of Planning and Research, who informed the group that the Governor’s staff and other state agencies have been slowly working on EJ issues. Sandra expressed OPR’s desire to share in training resources. She told about the positive experience OPR had recently with the youth of Literacy for Environmental Justice (LEJ) who spent a day at the Capitol, and informed the subcommittee that OPR is developing an environmental justice curriculum. She invited members to participate in the “Toxic Tour” scheduled for February 25th where state agency directors, along with local elected officials, visit sites of toxic contamination. It was stated that site tours are a great way to impress upon officials the dangers and potentials of toxic locations in local neighborhoods.

- Ken asked the EJSC if a working group should be formed to prioritize items in the Work Plan, or if members were interested in discussing the Work Plan further.

IV. BRAINSTORMING SESSION

- After some discussion, it was suggested that a brainstorming session consider the following:

What tasks should be tackled in 2003? 2004?

What should be done first? Concurrently?

What criteria need to be prioritized?

- Subcommittee members responded with the following comments:
 - Fish consumption in Bayview/Hunter's Point
 - Yosemite Slough Project
 - Water transfers
 - Look at projects that share resources; leverage resources
 - Potential for scientists to become involved in fish mercury contamination and how it affects the populations that eat them
 - Need for CALFED to move beyond cost reimbursement
 - Need to survey numbers of farm workers who reside on the islands in Delta and secure names of contacts for these affected populations
 - Drinking water subcommittee has designated money to investigate exchange project—need to include mutual benefits to water/irrigation suppliers between Delta and Valley districts. Groundwater needs to be drinkable.
 - EJ mechanisms need to be involved in planning, implementation, and mitigation measures (water transfers).
 - In fall, there will be the feasibility study of Sites Reservoir
 - Fishing is a right protected by natural law; fish consumption is a supply issue for tribes
 - Farm Bill—money for technical support; moving money into the community through “contractor opportunities”
 - EJ needs to be included in upcoming Science Conference
 - How do we answer research questions not just academically but with advocacy? Need to provide background, history, and legal framework of EJ.
 - Young people are being certified through the EPA to test wetlands for contamination, but what about funding for employment or higher education?

Subcommittee Working Groups

- At the end of the brainstorming session, it was decided that a steering group was needed to prioritize and review the Work Plan. Issue-specific working groups shall also be established. Sign-up sheets were circulated; some subcommittee members listed only their names and contact information, while others specified what subject they were interested in working on. (A matrix of who signed up for which working group is appended at the end of this summary.)
- The question of how much time one would need to devote to the various working groups was asked. Ken responded that the working groups would take as much time as was needed to accomplish their objectives.
- Martha Guzman replied that she hoped that the working groups would not require a significant time commitment; she asked again about budgeting stipends so that all members of the EJSC could participate in working group meetings and be reimbursed for their time. Martha recommended approaching the management of CALFED when the various working groups had been formed to inquire if stipends were possible.
- Ken stated that he felt that the formation of steering committees/working groups would not take away from the work of the EJSC but rather legitimize it. Furthermore, by assisting Ken carry out the various objectives outlined in the Work Plan, the working groups would help the EJSC work more effectively.

V. LOCAL ISSUES DISCUSSION

- Fraser Shilling, a student at U.C. Davis, requested time to give a presentation about two studies he is coordinating. The first project Fraser discussed was a fish consumption study he is conducting in the Central Valley. According to Fraser, there are no ongoing monitoring programs concerned with fish consumption in this area. The questions his study aims to answer include:
 - Who is fishing where?
 - Where are toxins in fish the highest?
- The second project Fraser discussed was a California Watershed Assessment Manual he is creating. This manual will include ways to perform socio-economic and environmental justice reviews, which traditionally are not addressed in watershed assessments.
- Dave Tamayo, Sacramento County Department of Water Resources, spoke to the group next about the Sacramento County Stormwater Program. The NPDES permit the County has to release toxins into the water requires the County to address the issue of mercury entering the Delta from Sacramento County stormwater runoff. In Dave's words, that real people right now are eating contaminated fish is a real problem. He wants CALFED to engage the Sacramento community in addressing this problem. The Stormwater Program is also concerned with pesticides entering the Delta. Dave hopes that the goals of EJ will influence State policy to regulate pesticides more strictly. He also

informed the group that CALFED grant money, which would support and further the goals of EJ should be available soon.

- Renee Hoyos, Resources Agency, addressed the subcommittee last as she spoke about the California Biodiversity Council. As part of the Council, high-level officials meet 3 to 4 times per year to discuss local issues and determine ways to assist community members. The next Biodiversity Council meeting will be held on February 13th and the focus will be on environmental justice. The meeting will include an overview of the history of EJ, a community perspectives' panel, and a discussion of how natural resources agencies address environmental justice issues. She said the Council would like the EJSC to present a case study at this meeting, which is open to the public and will be held in Sacramento.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

- Subcommittee members recommended inviting the consultants working on flooding the islands in the Delta to speak at an upcoming meeting.
- It was requested that a draft list of EJSC priorities and projects for the next year be presented at the next EJSC meeting.
- A subcommittee member again suggested that future EJSC meetings be located in places where EJ issues occur.
- If future meetings are to be held in EJ communities, it was recommended that a history of the formation of the EJSC be included in the agenda.
- A subcommittee member told the group that California EPA is putting together grant proposals that should result in money for environmental justice issues.
- It was speculated that the passage of Prop. 50 would generate money for PSPs.

The meeting adjourned at 12:30 p.m. with the optional viewing of a documentary videotape about environmental justice produced by the Department of Justice.

Action Items

Owner	Task	Due Date
Ken McGhee	Organize the working groups so they can meet soon.	Next mtg.
Steering Committee	Provide the EJSC with a draft list of priorities from the Work Plan.	Next mtg.
Working Groups	Contact eachother and if unable to meet, brainstorm priorities and projects.	Next mtg.
Case Study Group	Meet and create a presentation of a case study regarding environmental justice for the Cal. Biodiversity Council meeting, February 13, 2003 in Sac.	February 13

Meeting Participants

Name	Affiliation	Phone / Fax	E-Mail Address
Eugenia Laychak	CALFED	916.654.4214	Laychak@water.ca.gov
Mary Dunne	Cal. Department of Fish & Game	209.948.7181	Mdunne@delta.dfg.ca.gov
Sonja Wadman	Public Affairs Management	916.658.0180 x 27	s.wadman@pamsf.com
John Folk Williams	California Center for Public Dispute Resolution	916.445.2079	Folkwill@csus.edu
Ken McGhee	CALFED	916.651.7098	Kmcghee@water.ca.gov
Kristen Carter	CSU Chico Environmental Projects Coordinator	530.893-5751	KCooper-Carter@csuchico.edu
Barbara Cross	Department of Water Resources	916.653.5150	
Michiyo Sakamoto	Department of Water Resources Division of Planning and Local Assistances	916.651.9253	Michiyo@water.ca.gov
Naomi Mabins	CALFED Science	616.653.2994	Nmabins@water.ca.gov
Peter Jacobsen	Metropolitan Water District	916.650.2650	Pjacobsen@mwdh2o.com
Sam Cervantes	U.S. Bureau of Reclamation	916.978.5104 916.978.5114 fax	Scervantes@mp.usbr.gov
Dave Tamayo	Sacramento County Dept. of Water Resources	916.874.8024	Tamayod@sacounty.net
Norman Calero	US EPA	415.972.3793	Calero.norman@epa.gov
Martha Guzman	United Farm Workers		Mguzman@ufwsacramento.org
Renee Hoyos	Resources Agency	916.653.9205	Renee.hoyos@resources.ca.gov
Torri Estrada	Env. Justice Coalition for Water	212.616.1229	Torri@lif.org
Amy Hui	Env. Justice Coalition for Water	408.287.6707	Ahui@igc.org
Sarah Farina	Env. Justice Coalition for Water	415.204.7209	Sarah@lif.org
Michael Warburton	Env. Justice Coalition for Water	510.644.0752	Mwarburton@jps.net
Coco Briseno	Caltrans	916.274.0629	Cbriseno@dot.ca.gov
Dan Wermiel	CALFED Watershed Program	916.651.7086	Dwermiel@water.ca.gov
David Breninger	Placer Co. Water Agency, Recreational Boaters of CA	530.823.4860	Dbreninger@pcwa.net
Alisha Deen		707.554.2052	Greendeen@hotmail.com
Romal Pascual	Cal EPA	916.324.8425	
Fraser Shilling	UC Davis	530.752.7859	Fmshilling@ucdavis.edu
Davies Ononiwu	Onitech System	916.714.9535	Davieso@onitech.net
Katie Eastham	Caltrans	916.274.0614	Eastham@dot.ca.gov
Sandra Salazar-Thompson	Office of Planning and Research	916.324.6660	Sandra.salazar-thompson@opr.ca.gov
Michelle Henry-Ellis	Literacy for Env. Justice	415.508.0575	Ej@lejyouth.org
Cleo Woelfte-Erskine	Literacy for Env. Justice	415.508.0575	Heronshhead@lejyouth.org

EJSC Working Groups

Name	Phone / Fax	E-Mail Address	Working Group
Sam Cervantes	916.978.5104 916.978.5114 fax	scervantes@mp.usbr.gov	Steering Committee
Eugenia Laychak	916.654.4214	laychak@water.ca.gov	Unspecified
Kristen Carter	530.893-5751	KCooper-Carter@csuchico.edu	All groups
Peter Jacobsen	916.650.2650	pjacobsen@mwdh2o.com	Unspecified
Norman Calero	415.972.3793	Calero.norman@epa.gov	Community outreach
Martha Guzman		Mguuzman@ufwsacramento.org	In-Delta Storage, Friant-MWD Exchange
Renee Hoyos	916.653.9205	Renee.hoyos@resources.ca.gov	Unspecified
Torri Estrada	212.616.1229	Torri@lif.org	Will email ideas of committees
Amy Hui	408.287.6707	Ahui@igc.org	Outreach/education, funding
Sarah Farina	415.204.7209	Sarah@lif.org	Unspecified
Michael Warburton	510.644.0752		Water transfers
Dan Wermiel	916.651.7086	Dwermiel@water.ca.gov	Fish consumption
David Breninger	530.823.4860	Dbreninger@pcwa.net	Steering Committee
Alisha Deen	707.554.2052	Greendeen@hotmail.com	Unspecified
Dave Tomayo	916.456.6154	Tamayod@saccounty.net	Mercury, pesticides, education
Fraser Shilling		Fmshilling@ucdavis.edu	All groups
Sandra Salazar-Thompson	916.324.6660	Sandra.salazar-thompsn@opr.ca.gov	Unspecified
Michelle Henry-Ellis	415.508.0575	Ej@lejyouth.org	Unspecified
Cleo Woelfte-Erskine	415.508.0575	Heronshhead@lejyouth.org	Unspecified